DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 148 716 SO 010 649

AUTHOR Northup, Terry; Barnes, Buckley
TITLE Developing Thinking Skills That Are Basic to Citizenship.
PUB DATE Nov 77
NOTE 20p.; Paper presented at Annual Meeting of the National Council for the Social Studies (Cincinnati, Ohio, November 23-26, 1977)

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.83 HC-$1.67 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Citizenship; Concept Teaching; Consumer Education; *Curriculum Development; Definitions; Educational Objectives; Elementary Secondary Education; Evaluation; Learning Activities; Lesson Plans; Literature Reviews; Mastery Learning; Moral Values; Problem Solving; *Productive Thinking; *Skill Development; *Social Studies; Student Motivation; *Teaching Techniques; Values

ABSTRACT

Focusing on thinking skills which are basic to citizenship, the paper reviews definitions of citizenship from Plato to the present, discusses scholarly thinking about citizenship, lists general principles of skill development, and presents two brief sample lessons. Citizenship is interpreted as social interaction which is based upon global responsibility as well as social conscience. Eight general principles of mental and physical skill development are identified, including skills developed through logical and organized activities; skills maintained through practice; and skills improved through practice and teacher feedback. The process for developing citizenship skills will vary according to student interests and available class time but should include an introductory stage to motivate students; a development stage in which the teacher demonstrates the skill and allows students to practice the skill; a student and lesson evaluation phase; and a reteaching stage which encourages all students to achieve acceptable proficiency. Two sample lessons are presented. The first is a 6th grade consumer economics lesson which requires students to analyze differences between fact and opinion. The second is a 1st grade lesson on families which illustrates how students can classify objects and experiences into logical categories. Learning activities include class discussion of photographs and statements, written exercises based on newspaper adds and magazine illustrations, group discussion, and art work. An outline of 19 primary intellectual skills and six advanced intellectual skills is presented. (Author/DB)

Documents acquired by ERIC include many informal unpublished materials not available from other sources. ERIC makes every effort to obtain the best copy available. Nevertheless, items of marginal reproducibility are often encountered and this affects the quality of the microfiche and hardcopy reproductions ERIC makes available via the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). EDRS is not responsible for the quality of the original document. Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made from the original.

ED148716

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

Developing Thinking Skills that are Basic to Citizenship

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
Buckley R. Barnes
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC) AND USERS OF THE ERIC SYSTEM."

Terry Northup
Wayland Baptist College
Plainview, Texas

Buckley Barnes
Georgia State University
Atlanta, Georgia

Presented at the annual meeting of the National Council for the Social Studies, Cincinnati, Ohio, November 1977

SO 010 649

Developing Thinking Skills that are Basic to Citizenship

On September 13, 1977 the Peanuts cartoon strip focused on a thinking skill. The first frame featured Lucy, sitting at her school desk, chin in her hands, and with a rather blank look in her eyes. In the second frame she suddenly sits up straight, puts her hands on her desk, looks alert, and says to the teacher, "Daydreaming?" In the third frame she continued, No ma'am, I wasn't daydreaming . . . And in the final frame she says, "I was just conceptualizing."

Now conceptualizing, it seems to me, is a very useful thinking skill. It is one of many thinking skills that we should be teaching in our classrooms. There are also values to be explored and developed, and behaviors that are based on thinking and valuing to be encouraged. This thinking/valuing/acting process which, when applied with a social conscience, is what we consider to be citizenship.

Although our definition does have considerable support in the literature, it is by no means acceptable to everyone. Foshay and Burton (1976, p.3), for example, recently wrote that "The term, 'citizenship,' has been bent and tortured through our history until it has almost lost its meaning. At various times, it has meant patriotism, conformity with the business ethic, abiding by the law, supporting the New Deal, and participating in war." They base their own definition on the work of Rawls published in his book, A Theory of Justice, and conclude that "citizenship is all those activities that seek just relations between individuals and social institutions" (Foshay and Burton, 1976, p.4).

Scholarly thinking about citizenship goes back at least as far as Plato and Aristotle (Cherryholmes, 1977, p.2). In our own country training for higher order citizenship was one of the chief value claims for the study of history even before

1860 (Price, 1969, p.36). Between 1860 and 1890 citizenship training continued to receive considerable emphasis in the literature (Price, 1969, p.36). Certainly the citizenship education of the late 1800s did not reflect the thinking/valuing/acting with a social conscience definition that we propose today. The citizenship curriculum of that period reflected the great influence of the American Historical Association. In 1892 the Committee of Ten on Secondary School Subjects of the National Education Association recommended that historical facts were to be "learned by heart and, when forgotten, learned again . . ." The goal of this was to "exercise" the faculties of the mind through the "memory work" and for the students to gain an adequate "store" of essential historical facts necessary to function as a good citizen (Barr, Barth, and Shermis, 1977, p.20).

In 1916 the National Education Association Committee on the Social Studies stated that the purpose of education was "the cultivation of good citizenship" (Barr, Barth, and Shermis, 1977, p.25). They described citizenship as "social efficiency" and emphasized skills and attitudes rather than facts (Barr, Barth, and Shermis, 1977, p.25). This notion of emphasizing skills and attitudes rather than facts, which was based on the work of John Dewey, probably did not significantly change the teaching of social studies in the schools. Many educators continued to believe that the proper path to good citizenship was through the acquisition of knowledge from history and the social sciences (Bechtol and Conte, 1976, p.2). What did emerge from the 1916 NEA position was the beginning of a dialogue that continues today between those who believe in reflective inquiry as the means of accomplishing the goal of citizenship education and those who believe in teaching historical facts as the means of achieving the same goal.

In 1923 Harold Rugg wrote in the 22nd Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education (NSSE) that citizenship education means gaining skills in making rational decisions. To make rational decisions, he went on, students must first perceive a problem, be interested in seeking a solution to that problem,

have the facts on all sides of the issue, and practice on situations that are somewhat similar (Barr, Barth, and Shermis, 1977, p.27). This belief, which is largely based on the work of Dewey, is very close to what some of us believe today.

A lot has happened since 1923. In the 1940s the question of value inculcation was paramount. In the 40s and 50s the transmission of selected cultural values, the memorization of specific facts, and separation of social studies back to the teaching of the separate disciplines were emphasized (Barr, Barth, and Shermis, 1977, p.35).

In 1957 Sputnik was launched by the Russians. This startling event was followed by an infusion of federal money to reform the teaching of several subjects, including social studies. Social science scholars became more interested in the social studies curriculum at the pre-college level and something called the New Social Studies was born. Project Social Studies came into being along with other social studies curriculum revision efforts sponsored by professional associations, the National Science Foundation and other funding sources.

Many of these projects reflected the social scientists' view that the key concepts and processes of the social sciences should be the main thrust of the social studies program. The term, social science education, which replaced the amorphous term, social studies, became popular.

In the mid 60s another group of scholars, who had a different viewpoint about social education, began thinking and writing about reflective inquiry as a means of citizenship education. The teaching of values clarification, social action regarding public issues, and some application of Bloom's Taxonomy entered the scene.

The notion of teaching an awareness of the social consequences of one's actions was advocated (Preston and Herman, 1974, p.244). Even more recently the concept of social conscience, as exemplified by the work of Lawrence Kohlberg and others, has been of interest to many social studies educators.

How do we cope with moral dilemmas? How does having a social conscience influence our thinking and acting about hunger, pollution, denial of human rights or energy consumption? That it should enter into the decision-making process is our bias. We believe that a sense of responsibility for humankind that is global is a necessary attribute of citizenship.

So, as we deal today with the topic of thinking skills that are basic to citizenship, please keep in mind that it is only one part of our definition.

Relating those thinking skills to our values then taking actions that reflect a social conscience form the totality of our definition of citizenship.

Now let's look at some of the thinking skills that we suggest are basic to citizenship.

References

Barr, R.D., Barth, J.L., & Shermis, S.S. Defining the Social Studies. Bulletin 51, Washington, D.C.: National Council for the Social Studies, 1977.

Bechtol, W.M. & Conte, A.E. Individually Guided Social Studies. Reading, Massachusetts: Addison-Wesley, 1977.

Cherryholmes, C.H., Response and Rejoinder on "Citizenship As the Aim of Social Studies." Theory and Research in Social Education, April, 1977, 1-4.

Foshay, A.W. with Burton, W.W. Citizenship as the Aim of the Social Studies, Theory and Research in Social Education, December 1, 1976, 1-22.

Price, R.A. Goals for the Social Studies, Social Studies Curriculum Developments: Prospects and Problems, 39th Yearbook. Washington, D.C.: National Council for the Social Studies, 1969.

General Principles of Skill Development

Before we get down to the specifics of how to construct a skill lesson, I want you to read, think about, and absorb certain principles that apply to skill learning whether it be mental or physical skills that you wish to develop.

1. Skills are developed through activities. The only way anyone can develop a skill is by performing that skill with increasing accuracy. Thus, to learn skills, the student must be actively involved in the learning process. Listening to lectures, watching films and filmstrips, and question-answer as a steady diet, will not develop significant number of skills because the student is relatively passive.
2. Skill development activities should be related to cognitive or affective goals you are trying to reach. Skills should not be taught in isolation. Students should come to see that skills are tools which can help them accomplish objectives more effectively. Skills are not important for any intrinsic value of their own for example, a student may be great at finding things on the index, but of what value is the skill if he never seeks information from books?
3. Skills are developed through a series of planned activities that are organized in a logical and sequential manner. Skills will not be developed by "one shot" activities. Nor will they be developed by random "hit or miss" activities. If you want students to develop a skill you must carefully plan a series of related activities which move from the simple and concrete to the complex and abstract. These activities may be done within a short period of time or stretched out over several weeks time.

4. Students must receive feedback concerning their mistakes in order to improve future performance. This feedback should be as immediate as possible (while the performance is still in the student's mind) and the feedback should be specific. If possible, correct the student's performance immediately until you get around to grading papers. There are various ways to do this; self-check keys on the bulletin board so students can check their own answers, exchanging papers and checking answers in class, or merely by circulating around the room yourself and commenting on the student's performance.

   Regarding being specific, give feedback that will help correct the student's performance. For example, don't say: "John, that was poor." Rather, say: "John you were asked to categorize the presidents by political party and you put Eisenhower, a Republican, and FDR, a Democrat, in the same category. Why did you do that? Do they both meet the criteria for Democrats?" Remember, criticize the performance, but not the performer.

5. While negative feedback (#4 above) is necessary, positive feedback must also be given to provide a sense of accomplishment and to provide motivation to keep trying to improve. Nothing succeeds like success. Even if students only make a little progress -- praise them for it. Unless some reinforcement is given to temper the negative feedback, the student is likely to quit before the skill is developed to an acceptable level of proficiency.

6. After a skill has been developed, occasional practice is necessary to keep the student's proficiency level high enough to be functional. There is an old saying that you never forget how to ride a bike. However, if you haven't ridden one for a year or so, you are bound to be wobbly when you try again. Every athletic team starts out with

several weeks or months of practice before their season begins. Even professionals must practice old skills as well as learn new ones. During the season athletes practice between games to keep their proficiency levels high. Teachers should follow this pattern with their "players": review basic skills at the beginning of the year and during the year provide opportunities for practice at regular intervals.

7. Practice does not make perfect. We all have inherent limits to our abilities. Practice, if it is well designed and well directed, will help us develop our skills up to our inherent limits but not beyond them. You could practice basketball 10 hours a day for the next year under an able coach and not be able to make the N.B.A. team because you don't have the ability. When you have students in class who have "peaked out", who are no longer showing progress, do not continue to push them or you will destroy their confidence and desire. They may already be doing their best, and what more can you ask?
8. Do not expect the same level of performance from all students. This does not mean that you don't have some minimum standard that you try to help everyone achieve. However, it is unrealistic to expect that given three practice activities, everyone will achieve the same level of proficiency. Some will be "stars" and others will be "bench warmers". The effort you should make is to help each be the best she or he can be.

A Process for Developing Skills

The process that follows is rather simple but it is effective. It was developed by me and has been modified based on suggestions from Dr. Buckley Barnes of Georgia State University. Together we have presented this model at several national conferences.

In the process we use the term "skill development lesson". We use the term lesson broadly and do not mean to imply that there is a 50 minute limit to the lesson. Sometimes teachers think of a lesson as being invariably 50 minutes in length because that is the length of the normal high school class period. We think of planning for teaching as being similar to a theme.

course = theme

unit = paragraph

lesson = sentence

In this analogy both a sentence and a lesson are one complete thought. Some sentences are long and some are short. The same is true of lessons. Some take one half hour and others may take two or three hours. A skill development lesson should contain the parts described below and are designed to initially develop a skill or to provide application of the skill in relation to new content. There is no way to guarantee how long such a lesson would last.

1. Lesson Opener: There are two purposes to the lesson opener. The first purpose is to motivate students to want to develop the skill that has been selected. Second, the teacher needs to determine students' existing levels of proficiency. Which students have a very low level of proficiency and are likely to need special help? This information can be especially helpful if you wish to pair or group students.
   Sometimes students think they are skillful in an area when they are not. A brief "pretest" can help students discover what their skill levels are.
2. Lesson Development. This is the heart of the lesson. This stage also contains two parts. First, it is necessary for the teacher to demonstrate the skill one or more times within a content context.
   The second step is to create several exercises or activities which will allow the students to practice the skill. It is necessary for the teacher to closely monitor the practice sessions so that students do not practice

the skill incorrectly. Also, the teacher needs to provide encouragement liberally. After all, the students are doing something they know they are not good at; something that may be new to them. They need all the support they can get.

3. Evaluation: There are two levels of evaluation. On the first level the teacher evaluates each student in terms of the skill. Is he or she more skillful than when the lesson began? Has he or she attained an acceptable level of skillfulness or is further development needed? Secondly, the teacher evaluates the lesson. Was this lesson effective with the students? Were the instructions clear? Did students have difficulty with any of the activities? If so, how could these activities be changed? Were there enough activities?

4. Reteaching: If the skill is worth teaching in the first place, it is worth taking extra time to help each student achieve acceptable proficiency. Thus, for the students whose progress was not satisfactory, reteaching should be provided. This should not consist of redoing the same activities that have previously been ineffective. Rather, the teacher must analyze why each student failed and provide individual help. If several students had the same difficulty, then they can be grouped. While thorough planning in the beginning can reduce the number of students who need reteaching, there probably will always be one or two who need extra help. Mastery, not coverage of skills, should be every teacher's goal.

Sample Lesson #1

Skill: Analysis -- The student can differentiate between fact and opinion.

Objective: Each student will be able to identify, with 90% accuracy, statements as being either fact or opinion.

Content Context: Consumer economics, 6th grade

1. Lesson Opener:

   a. Motivation -- Ask, "How would you like to be able to tell when someone is telling you something that is a fact (something that can be proven) or when someone is telling you something that is an opinion (something that a person believes but that cannot be proven)?

      Discuss: "How would it help you if you had this skill?"

   b. "Let's find out how well you can tell the difference between facts and opinions. Close your eyes. After each statement that I read, raise your hand if you think that it is a fact. Do not raise your hand if you believe that it is an opinion."

      (1) Red Ball Jets are the best. They make you run faster and jump higher.

      (2) One ounce of Quaker 100% Natural Cereal contains 4% of the U.S. recommended daily allowance of protein.

      (3) An independent study shows that 60% of Palmolive dishwashing liquid users' hands improved.

      (4) All the kids prefer Barbie dolls.

2. Lesson Development:

   a. Demonstration -- "Would you like some clues to look for to help you know whether a T.V. or newspaper ad can be believed? To be a fact, a statement should include a) information that has been proven, or that can be proven, b) all appropriate information, not just what some person likes, and c) words or terms that do not appeal only to your emotions. It is also helpful for statements of fact to contain some evidence or reference to evidence so that you can check out the statement for yourself. Let's look at two of the examples of facts and opinions that I read to you. The statement that Red Ball Jets are the best because they make you run

faster and jump higher is not a fact. It is an opinion. It has not been proven, and, undoubtedly, if we tested this statement by timing how fast we ran and measuring how high we jumped while wearing Red Ball Jets and some other brands of shoes, we would find out that the statement is not true. One clue that it is not a fact is that it contains a word that some person liked. The word is "best". Probably the person who wants people to buy Red Ball Jets likes for people to think they are the best. The word "best" appeals to people's emotions. Most people want to have the best. It is not very likely that most people will like Red Ball Jets best. Therefore, it is not a fact. It is only the opinion of some people that they are best. Now let's look at the statement about the breakfast cereal. Is the statement about one ounce of Quaker 100% Natural Cereal containing 4% of the U.S. recommended daily allowance of protein a fact or an opinion? First, let's ask ourselves if there is any evidence to help prove the truthfulness of the statement. There is a chart on the cereal box that indicates that the protein content of the cereal has been measured and that the amount of protein found in one ounce is equal to 4% of the daily recommended allowance according to the United States Government. The information on the box contains all of the appropriate information but does not include any words or terms that appeal to people's emotions. It does not contain any suggestion as to what some people like. These are all clues that the statement is a fact, not an opinion. Further, the information on the box includes the address of the Consumer Services Department of the cereal company where the consumer can write for additional nutritional information.

The other two statements that I read to you can be analyzed in a similar way to determine if they are facts or opinions.

b. Practice -- "Get out the newspapers that I asked you to bring to school today. Look at some of the advertisements. Select four ads to analyze to see if they contain facts or opinions. Write down why you classified each advertising statement as a fact or an opinion. In 15 minutes we will move into groups. At that time show the others members of your group your ads, tell them whether you think each one is a fact or an opinion, and give your reasons. See if all of the group members agree with your decisions. Discuss any disagreements. Listen to other peoples' reasons for their decisions. If your group still does not agree, raise your hand and I will come to your group as quickly as possible to help you.

3. Evaluation:

a. Individual student progress -- "Here are some statements that I want you to think about. Decide if each is a fact or an opinion. Then write your reasons beside each."

(1) An independent testing agency tested our battery against other leading brands, and ours had more power. (Data available upon request.)

(2) Save money at our fourth annual going-out-of-business sale.

(3) Everybody's favorite is Crunchy Peanutbutter.

(4) Florida orange juice is better.

b. Lesson effectiveness -- Did most of the children improve their skill at differentiating between facts and opinions? If they did, the lesson was successful.

4. Reteaching:

Talk with the students who do not demonstrate the skill in all four of the evaluation items. Ask them to explain their reasoning for each answer. From the reasons given or from further probing, determine what thinking errors the students are making. Explain why their thinking is in error. Provide new statements for evaluation and determine progress.

Sample Lesson #2

Skill: The student is able to classify objects or experiences into logical categories.

Objective: Given pictures of groups of people and their titles, the student will determine, with 90% accuracy, whether the groups are families or non-families.

Content Context: Families, 1st grade.

1. Lesson Opener:

   a. Motivation:

      1. Show a picture of a male lion, female lion, and cubs and a picture of a human family. Ask students if they can tell one thing that is the same in both pictures. If they do not say that both are families, structure questions to lead to this conclusion.

      2. Ask the class members to raise their hands if they have no brothers or sisters. Then ask class members to raise their hands if they have 2 or more brothers and sisters. Ask, "Are all families the same size?" Then, "What does it take to make a family?" -- that is what we want to learn about in the next few days. We will learn how families of our class are the same as and different from other families.

   b. Pre-test:

      Let's see if you think the pictures I am going to show you are families. When I show a picture raise your hand if you think it is a family.

      Pictures to include: one child alone; father, mother, 3 children; one parent, one child; parents, children, and grandparents; a large group of people at a ballgame, a church congregation; and a ball team. (pictures to include families of all races)

2. Lesson Development:

a. Demonstration:

1. Provide a duplicated picture of a family. After the children have studied the picture, ask them why this is a family. Stress that it includes parents and children.
2. Ask students to describe their families. Then ask them if they will still be a part of their family when they grow up and move away. Stress that even when you don't live at home you are a member of your family. At this point the teacher can share with the class about his or her family. State that parents and children make up a family even if they do not live together.
3. Show a picture of an extended family with one or more grandparents or other relatives living in the home. Is this a family? Why?
4. Tell the story of an orphan. Ask whether he or she is a family? Then continue the story having a family adopt the orphan. Is he or she now a part of a family?
5. Finally talk about a family of two parents and two children. If one of the parents dies, do the remaining family members constitute a family?
6. Show a picture of a group of children playing a game. Is this a family?
7. In each instance above, ask students if they know families of this type.

b. Practice:

1. Have the children cut out pictures from magazines which show families and non-families. Visit with each student and be sure he or she can explain why the picture is an example or non-example.
2. Put students in small groups and give them poster boards. Let them make collages of families and non-families. When they have finished, let each group tell the class about their collage.

3. Evaluation:

Using the pictures from the pre-test and a few new pictures, evaluate the students in the following way:

Give then an answer sheet.

1.
2.
3.
4.
5.
6.
7.
8.
9.
10.

If picture number 1 is a picture of a family, have the student put a smile on face number 1 and a frown if it is not a family. Do this for each of ten pictures.

4. Reteaching:

Any student who does not respond correctly to 9 out of 10 of the questions should be helped individually. Ask them to explain their responses to the incorrect items. Perhaps they understand the concept but misinterpreted the picture -- in which case they are not wrong. If several students make an incorrect response to one picture, consider whether your picture was appropriate. Then substitute another picture which represents the same idea and see if they still make an incorrect response. Explain the idea again. (For example, if it is a one parent family that they are miscategorizing, re-explain your logic for calling it a family -- use a new story or try to find a famous family they can relate to -- such as the family in the TV show Eight is Enough or the Tony Randall Show if they watch such shows.

INTELLECTUAL SKILLS
(Preliminary Level)

1. The student is able to observe situations in an objective manner and report what was observed.
2. The student is able to summarize material he has read or heard in class in a clear and concise way.
3. The student is able to classify objects or experiences into logical categories.
4. The student is able to compare two objects or experiences and state in which ways they are similar and in which ways dissimilar.
5. The student is able to imagine himself as being someone else or as himself in a different situation or time period.
6. The student is able to look at a set of data or read a position statement and make inferences.
    a) The student can infer what the writer believes by reading a given statement.
    b) The student can infer what would happen given certain conditions.
7. The student can differentiate between statements of fact and statements of opinion.
8. Given a set of consistent data regarding some central theme, the student is able to draw a generalization.
9. Given a generalization, the student is able to recognize whether a new piece of data supports or does not support the generalizatio
10. Given a problem, the student is able to list several plausible hypotheses regarding its solution.
11. Given a hypothesis and some data, the student is able to determine which bits of data are relevant to or irrelevant to the hypothesis
12. Given a hypothesis and bits of data, the student can determine which support and which refute the hypothesis.
13. Given statements of belief, the student is able to identify basic assumptions, stated or unstated.
14. The student is able to interpret and summarize data in graphs and use them to portray data.
    a) The student can accurately summarize data presented in various types of graphs.
    b) Given a set of appropriate data, the student can translate the data into graph form.
15. The student is able to interpret and summarize tabular data and to use them to portray data.
    a) Given a table of data, the student can draw warranted conclusions.
    b) Given descriptive data, the student can organize it in tabular form.
16. The student is able to interpret political cartoons.
    a) Given a political cartoon, the student can explain the symbolism used.
    b) Given political cartoons, the student can accurately describe the cartoonists' views of the situation depicted.
17. Given appropriate data, the student is able to determine which is more biased and which is less biased.
18. The student is able to detect illustrations of the use of propaganda techniques.
19. Given a situation and a proposed course of action, the student is able to project the probable consequences of the action.

INTELLECTUAL SKILLS
(Advanced Level)

Advanced level requires the synthesis of several simple skills which should have been developed previously.

1. The student is able to look at a situation and state what is problematic about it.
    a) The student can discern what difficulty lies at the center of a disagreement between individuals or groups.
    b) Given a goal, the student can list what impediments seem to block clear passage to the goal.
    c) Given a goal, the student can list several possible means of accomplishing the goal and realizes the problem is to select which approach to take.
    d) The student can clearly and specifically state the problem in an objective manner.
2. Given a problem, the student is able to state several plausible hypotheses.
    a) The student can survey data on hand and make inferences from it as to possible solutions.
    b) The student can imagine solutions to the problem and list them.
    c) The student can state hypotheses in "if, then" statements (which requires inferring what will happen if certain conditions are given).
    d) Given that it may be impossible to test all possible hypotheses, the student can select either one or a small group of closely related hypotheses to test and state why this one (or group) is most plausible.
    e) The student can project what data or what type of data must be gathered to test the hypotheses.
3. The student is able to collect data appropriate to the hypothesis or hypotheses being tested.
    a) Based on the projected data needed (2,e), the student can organize a plan to collect the needed data (probably a step-by-step list of resources needed or activities to be performed).
    b) The student can distinguish between relevant and irrelevant data.
    c) The student can use forms of observation to collect data (interviews, surveys, participant observer techniques).
    d) The student can summarize written material into notes which can later be organized.
    e) The student has acquired the prerequisite library skills to locate material quickly and efficiently.
    f) The student can interpret and write summaries of data contained in charts, graphs, and tables.

4. The student is able to classify the data into meaningful organization and analyze it.
    a) The student is able to associate all of the collected data which is related.
    b) The student is able to discern whether a given cluster of data is consistent.
    c) The student can discriminate whether statements are based on fact or opinion.
    d) The student can identify the stated or unstated assumption of an individual or group point of view.
    e) The student can distinguish between biased and unbiased information.
    f) The student can evaluate which source of data is most vali
    g) The student can compare related data and summarize the relationship of it if any exists.
    h) The student can identify loaded statements and statements which utilize propaganda techniques.
    i) The student understands his own values and attempts to analyze the data as objectively as possible.
5. The student is able to draw a tentative conclusion.
    a) The student can determine (and justify) whether (1) the hypothesis is proven, (2) disproven, (3) neither proven nor disproven.
    b) If #3 is the case, the student can suggest whether the next step should be to collect more data or to restate the hypothesis.
    c) If the hypothesis is disproven, the student can use the data to either draw conclusions or propose a more plausible hypothesis.
    d) The student cannot only state conclusions, but can also suggest what actions these conclusions infer.
    e) The student can explain these conclusions and inferences clearly in either written or oral form.
6. Based on the foregoing, the student can decide on which course of action he will pursue or would suggest to others.
    a) The student can specify the various choices available.
    b) The student can project the consequences of actions which people (or he) might take based on his collection of data and conclusions.
    c) The student can state his value choices and determine to what extent they are congruent with the data or deviant from them.
    d) With advanced knowledge of the probable consequences, the student takes action (or recommends action) knowing that whatever the consequences turn out to be, they are to be considered as data for future decision-making.